



Comhpháirtíocht Leader Waterford Leader
Phort Láirge Partnership

Decision of Evaluation Committee

Project ID	31LDRWAT106582
Project Type:	Social Enterprise
Project Name:	Villierstown Enterprise Centre-Part Development
Promoters Name:	Villierstown Community Development Clg
Address:	Villierstown, Co. Waterford
Description:	The project involves the building of a community enterprise facility in a brown field site in the middle of the village of Villierstown. This is innovative in that it will provide a modern facility to house mobile workers. It is also innovative in that it is using a derelict brown field site in the middle of the village. This will deal with dereliction in the heart of the village.
Theme:	Local Objective 3 The revitalisation of Local Villages through the development of Human Capital and Capital Investment in two Infrastructural projects
Sub-theme:	Rural Towns SA 3.2 Capital investment in the development of one new Industrial/Office facility in a rural village
Link to LDS	L.O. 3, Strategic Action 3.2

Total Project Costs	€447,054.94 €178,200 or 39.86% of eligible expenditure.
Eligible Project Costs	€447,054.94 €178,200 or 39.86% of eligible expenditure
Funding sought by promoter:	€178,200 or 39.86% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser amount.
Funding recommended by Evaluation Committee:	A maximum of €178,200 or 39.86% of eligible expenditure
Details of private funding:	Cash/Money in account 200,000 Loan/Bridging Finance 68,854.94 (Loan 80K)
Voluntary Labour: YES / NO (If yes provide detail)	No
Synopsis of project:	The project involves the building of a community enterprise facility in a brown field site in the middle of the village of Villierstown by a Local Volunteer led development group. They have worked collaboratively with the Council, State Agencies and the Private Sector to bring this project forward. It is a Social Enterprise project. This is innovative in that it will provide a modern facility to house mobile

	workers. It is also innovative in that it is using a derelict brown field site in the middle of the village. This will deal with dereliction in the heart of the village.		
Detail exactly what WLP will be funding (List items from Project Assessment Report)	Detail	Total Cost (Expenditure)	Grant Aid recommend by the Evaluation Committee @ 39.86 %
	Construction of Enterprise Centre	447,054.94	€178,200 or 39.86 % of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.
		447,054.94	€178,200 or 39.86 % of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.
Total Funding			
Was an assessment completed?: Date:	13/03/2018		
Are detailed costings provided for the project? Were the costs for the project considered reasonable and how was this measured?	Yes. The costings were obtained through an E-Tenders Process vetted by a qualified Architect and 5 tenders were received. The Evaluation Committee agreed that the costs are reasonable as the lowest quote was chosen.		
Where the procurement process resulted in less than 3 quotes, the EC must show the additional steps taken to ensure the reasonableness of costs:	N/A		
Innovative Element of the project:	The project is innovative in that it is using a derelict brown field site in the middle of the village.		
Consideration of Deadweight:	The project will not be able to proceed without grant aid.		
Consideration of Displacement:	The Evaluation Committee agreed that this project will not cause displacement but will provide a facility that is lacking in the village.		
Economic justification for project:	Funding this project will provide a modern office facility to allow distance working for Cork based employees.		
Average Score for Project:	67/100		
% level of aid & ceiling:	A maximum of €178,200 or 39.86% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.		
E. C. Executive Summary/Rationale for Funding	The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend funding this project for the following reasons:- - Funding this project will provide a modern office facility to allow distance working for Cork based employees. This will be a pilot scheme for the County. - It was agreed that the promoters are very capable and reliable and it was suggested that if funded it should be conditional that they existing committee members remain in place for the required five years after the project is funded. - The project fits the Co Waterford Local Development Plan under Local Objective 3 Strategic Action 3.2 The Evaluation Committee agreed that they are happy to recommend supporting this project with the following conditions:- • Montessori School - Funding is conditional on promoters receiving POBAL funding of €70,000 to enable School to		

	relocate. • Rent Generation - Promoters must actively market the enterprise centre and report its activities to WLP every 6 months. • Mentoring – Promoters to receive mentoring on marketing the project to ensure adequate rental income. A maximum €178,200 or 39.86 % of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.
--	--

Jobs Created	Jobs Sustained	Match Funding	Previous Grant Aid Received
3		Yes	€21,800

Confirmation that agencies / communities are supportive of the proposed project.	Date of Confirmation	Signed By
LEO	14/03/2018	Brid Kirby
Faite Ireland	14/03/2018	Hilary Creedon

Meeting on the 14 5 18 : Detail of Discussion: The main points raised in the discussion of this project were:-

Mr Jimmy Taaffe Project Officer advised that the response to queries raised was circulated in the evaluation pack and confirmed the following:-

- The Tourism office will be used as an administration office for Black water Eco Tours and will be leased to VECP for this purpose.
- The correspondence outlined the company structures and in reality both share Directors said Mr Taaffe.
- Clarification on Finance. The project was designed to be developed in 3 separate phases:-
 - ❖ Glamping Site - €90k from Town and Village Renewal Scheme & €60k from TOMAR
 - ❖ Enterprise/Tourism Facility - €200K from TOMAR (subject to LEADER funding), €178K LEADER & €80K loan from Community Finance Ireland
 - ❖ Montessori Scholl - €70k Early years & School aged childcare scheme & €50K – term loan Clann Credo
- Mr Jimmy Taaffe advised that the site was purchased by the Local Authority ad leased to the promoters for €1 per year on a 20 year lease.
- The Local Authority also purchased the glamping pods so effectively the promoters got the site and glamping pods free of charge.
- It was confirmed that the TOMAR funding for the Enterprise centre is conditional on the promoter being awarded LEADER funding.
- Mr Jimmy Taaffe explained that as the promoters were already awarded funding for the boat tours project it could only apply to LEADER for €178,200 for this this project.
- Renting of the Glamping Pods will be the main source of income.
- The third phase the Montessori School can be developed later if necessary. The Evaluation Committee noted that Phase 2 of the project the enterprise centre is dependent on the income from the Montessori School. A discussion ensued on the likelihood of the promoters being successful with their application to POBAL. Mr Jimmy Taaffe said that POBAL may allocate funding to centres of greater population than Villierstown. If they don't get the €70,000 from POBAL then the Montessori School will stay in its present location.

- It was confirmed that the staff for the centre will be provided through a Community Service Programme (CSP) which will fund a Manager and three staff members for three years. Usually these types of schemes continue after the initial three years.
- Mr Jimmy Taaffe stated that rural West Waterford is very close to Cork and this project is a pilot scheme to see if putting proper infrastructure in place will encourage people to live & work in the area. The WLP office building in Lismore was given as an example of renting office space to private individuals who do not wish to commute.
- The Evaluation expressed concern for the whole project if the income from the Montessori School is not realised. The promoter's biggest problem is having the income to service the loan noting that if the pods and renting of the office space is successful that it will help enormously.
- It was agreed that the promoters are very capable and reliable and it was suggested that if funded it should be conditional that the existing committee members remain in place for the required five years after the project is funded.
- It was noted that Villierstown is becoming a tourism destination for water sports. A discussion ensued on the lack of accommodation with it being said that Youghal is the biggest beneficiary. Mr Jimmy Taaffe said that the number of Airbnb in the area is growing.

The Evaluation Committee agreed that they are happy to recommend supporting this project with the following conditions:-

- **Montessori School** - Funding is conditional on promoters receiving POBAL funding of €70,000 to enable School to relocate.
- **Rent Generation** - Promoters must actively market the enterprise centre and report its activities to WLP every 6 months.
- **Mentoring** – Promoters to receive mentoring on marketing the project to ensure adequate rental income.

Recommendation of Evaluation Committee: A maximum €178,200 or 39.86% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.

Meeting on the 9 4 18: The main points raised in the discussion of this project were:-

- Mr Jimmy Taaffe briefly outlined the background of the promoters noting that they are well organised and detailed what they have achieved to date and briefly outlined the project to the promoters.

The promoters are together as a community group since 2010 when they set up the Villierstown Education & Culture Project CLG which has charitable status. Under this company they run a Montessori School in the local community funded by Pobal. Following advice a new company the Villierstown Community CLG was set up and this does not have charitable status.

The derelict building is on a large site in the centre of the village. The façade of the building is listed and will be retained.

The proposal is that by providing an Enterprise Hub/Hot Desk facility it will help to generate economic activity in the area. Several start-ups in the area have expressed an interest in using the facilities once it is available and also a number of individuals living in the area that commute or work from home have expressed their interest. It will be an enterprise space with CEP funding to pay for a manager and a couple of staff similar to Tallow Enterprise Centre and Dunhill.

The Montessori School will relocate into the building once complete and will pay rent. Currently the school is located

upstairs in a building across the road which isn't very suitable.

The centre will have offices to rent out along with a tourist information centre downstairs.

The organisation has received a lot of support from TOMAR who has already funded glamping units a separate element of this project. TOMAR has also given a conditional offer of €200,000 subject to approval of this project. The match finance is coming from a loan from Community Finance Ireland.

- While discussing the financials the Evaluation Committee stated that servicing the loan may be a bit of a worry and they were uncertain of the viability of the project. There was no provision for the repayment of the €80,000 loan in the projections. Also greater financial clarity between both companies is required.
- It was noted that no one was going to rent and make money from a tourist information centre and that the €2,800 rental should be removed from the projections. Failte Ireland only fund 8 nationally. Mr Jimmy Taaffe advised that the intention was that the booking of the boats, etc could be done at the centre. It may be more of an administrative office rather than a tourist office.
- The amount of funding being put in by the promoters to actual spend was considered very low, less than 20%. The possibility of lowering the percentage was discussed but the Committee were uncertain that the group could support borrowing another €20,000.
- A discussion ensued on the population size of 207 and the amount of investments being received. The Evaluation Committee said that they could not see the required footfall in Villierstown to make the project successful.
- It was queried if the promoters had any confirmed tenants? Mr Jimmy Taaffe noted that interest had been expressed by people working in Apple and others working at home.
- It was queried if any similar projects will be coming in from the nearby areas.
- It was suggested that the centre could be used as a hub for promoting activities in the surrounding areas but it was noted that this was not something that came from a strategic plan and other areas may have their own ideas.
- It was queried if Ballnamella / Aglish & Clashmore will suffer for all the funding going into Villierstown. Ms Connors advised that currently training is underway to try and generate projects along the Blackwater. The idea of the training is to look at more strategic planning to support a bigger wider area.
- The Evaluation Committee said that the preferable option would have been for the local communities to come together and devise a plan for the area as funding several similar projects in a small area is not the best idea.
- Mr Jimmy Taaffe noted the benefit in renovating the remaining derelict building in Villierstown.

Recommendation: The Evaluation Committee agreed to defer consideration of this project subject to further clarification on:-

- **The promoters ability to service the debt**
- **Better financial information**
- **Clarification on what the tourist office will be doing**

Amount Recommended: A maximum €178,200 or 39.86 % of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.	39.86% of Eligible Project Funding:
--	--

Signed: _____ Signed: _____

Chairperson of Evaluation Committee Committee Member

Date: _____ Date: _____

Issues / Queries raised by Evaluation Committee	Project Officers Response
Break down of Costs between the Various elements, Enterprise Centre, Montessori, etc.	Detailed Breakdown provided to the Committee.

Signed: _____ Dated: _____

WLP Project Officer

Overall Evaluation Committee Scoring Record

Date: 14th May 2018

Time: 11am to 2pm

Project Title: Villierstown Enterprise Centre-Part Development

Project Reference Number: 311DRWAT106582

Assessment Criteria	Objective	Issues raised by Evaluation Committee	Weighting	Score
Compatibility with Local Development Strategy	Do the project proposals meet the criteria set out in the LAG business plan for the relevant measure?		Yes / No	
Innovation	Is the product innovative in its nature and does it displace existing enterprises? - Product / Service 9/19 <u>8</u> - Displacement 5/19 <u>4</u> - Job Creation 5/19 <u>4</u>		19	16
Promoters experience	Does the promoter have the training/skills, track record or experience to deliver? - Standards of Operation 6/25 <u>5</u> - Track Record 6/25 <u>6</u> - Structure of Business 6/25 <u>4</u> - Necessary skills base 7/25 <u>5</u>		25	20
Financial Viability	Are the project costs justifiable (reasonableness of costs) and / is funding available to co-fund the project? - Overall Costs 7/25 <u>3</u> - Co Funding 6/25 <u>4</u> - Financial Plan 6/25 <u>2</u>		25	15

	- Deadweight	6/25	6		
Sustainability	Is the project viable and will the service continue to be delivered?			13	4
Requirement	Does the proposal target a specific need or address a specific gap in the market?			18	9
Total				100	67

N.B. Project must receive a minimum score of 65% prior to being recommended for approval.

- Has the potential level of deadweight been assessed for this project? YES ~~NO~~
- i.e. would the project proceed without LEADER funding? YES / NO

Recommendations of the Evaluation Committee: Approved subject to conditions agreed by Committee

Signature: 
Signature of Evaluation Committee Chair

Date: 14th Dec 2018

Denise Walsh

From: pclerkin@cablesurf.com
Sent: Tuesday 5 June 2018 11:02
To: Denise Walsh
Subject: Draft minutes May 14 2018

Dear Denise,

I confirm that I am in agreement with the Draft minutes attached for the Evaluation Committee Meeting held on 14th May 2018.

Paul Clerkin

