



Comhpháirtíocht Leader Waterford Leader
Phort Láirge Partnership

Decision of Evaluation Committee

Project ID	31LDRWAT108255
Project Type:	Capital
Project Name:	West Waterford Festival of Food
Promoters Name:	Waterford County Festival of Food CLG
Address:	The Courthouse, Dungarvan
Description:	West Waterford Festival of Food is one of the biggest community food festivals in the country with a national and international profile. Food and Waterford Way is a brand established in 2017 to promote and tell the story of the food and drink producers of Waterford, using the vehicle of a food trail or food tourism offering to do so. The promoters are seeking funds to support the presentation and production costs for the nearly 100 artisan food producers who attend the festival in April over two days, including equipment hire, marketing, services etc. They also wish to support Waterford artisan food producers (currently 24 and 10 restaurants) with a year round programme of supports including mentoring, networking, publicity and training.
Theme:	The project is being assessed under the LEADER Food Initiative, a separate fund for the artisan/small food and beverage business
Sub-theme:	As above
Link to LDS	Linked to the Local Development Strategy and support for the food and beverage sector

Total Project Costs	€60,264.20		
Eligible Project Costs	€60,264.20		
Funding sought by promoter:	€45,198.15		
Funding recommended by Evaluation Committee:	-A maximum of € €33,048.15 or 75% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.		
Details of private funding:	€11,016		
Voluntary Labour: YES / NO (If yes provide detail)	No		
Synopsis of project:	Funding sought for the presentation and production costs for the nearly 100 artisan food producers who attend the West Waterford Food Festival in April 2019 including equipment hire and marketing		
Detail exactly what WLP will be funding (List items from Project	Detail	Total Cost ex VAT	Grant Aid recommend by the

Assessment Report)		(Expenditure)	Evaluation Committee @ 75 %
	Bus services	3,700	2,775
	Cater Hire	3,705.20	2,778.90
	Design Services	7,793	5,844.75
	Marquee & equipment hire	4,615	3,461.25
	Photographic services	3,750	2,812.50
	Temporary toilet services	580	435
	Print Services	15,515	11,636.25
	Radio Advertising	2,376	1,782
	Sound and equipment hire	2,030	1,522.50
	Consultant Services	16,200	0
		€60,264.20	€33,048.15
Total Funding			
Was an assessment completed?: Date: <u>8th Oct '18</u>	Yes		
Are detailed costings provided for the project? Were the costs for the project considered reasonable and how was this measured?	Yes, direct tendering was used and the most economic advantageous tender process used to select suppliers		
Where the procurement process resulted in less than 3 quotes, the EC must show the additional steps taken to ensure the reasonableness of costs:	The promoter tried to secure the required number of quotes and evidence of invitation to quote was provided		
Innovative Element of the project:	West Waterford Festival of Food is one of the biggest community food festivals in the country with a national and international profile. Food and the Waterford Way is a brand and innovative new concept established in 2017 to promote and tell the story of the food and drink producers of Waterford, using the vehicle of a food trail or food tourism offering to do so		
Consideration of Deadweight:	The project would proceed on a much reduced basis.		
Consideration of Displacement:	The only other food festival of similar scale is the Harvest Festival which takes place in Waterford City six months after West Waterford Festival of Food. The Wexford Food and Wine Festival takes place in May each year and is also at a smaller scale.		
Economic justification for project:	Based on an increase in visitor numbers to the festival and possible linking to overnight accommodation		
Average Score for Project:	80/100		
% level of aid & ceiling:	A maximum of € €33,048.15 or 75% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.		
E. C. Executive Summary/Rationale for Funding	The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend funding this project for the following reasons:-		

	1. The project fits the LEADER Food Initiative for supporting artisan food producers in Co Waterford. 2. The project will support the 2019 festival and maximise the potential benefit for the participating food enterprises 3. The festival is an important social and economic benefit to the area. The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend funding this project with the following condition: - The consultancy element of the application shall not be funded. A maximum of € €33,048.15 or 75% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.
--	---

Jobs Created	Jobs Sustained	Match Funding	Previous Grant Aid Received
0	0	€11,016	€97,175 2018 to date

Confirmation that agencies / communities are supportive of the proposed project.	Date of Confirmation	Signed By
Local Enterprise Office	8th Oct '18	Brid Kirby

Detail of Discussion: The following were the main points raised in the discussion of the project:-

- Ms Claire Connors briefly outlined the project to the Evaluation Committee advising that the festival is now in its 12th year and still growing. Saturday and Sunday are predominately the busy days and figures provided show that the festival drew in 35,000 visitors last year.
- The promoters are seeking capital assistance to run the festival and also funding towards consultancy services.
- The consultancy service is actually the food trail set up in 2017. The promoters tendered out the management of the Waterford way food trail for the 2019 season. Three quotations were sought but only one was received. Ms Connors asked the Evaluation Committee to consider the following two issues:-

- 1) Procurement – The promoters sought out three quotations but received one. The rules state three quotes must be obtained.
- 2) Consultancy versus employment – The promoters tendered out management of the artisan side of the festival. The consultant will provide a year round programme of supports through mentoring to the 24 local artisan producers. The successful tender was the person who established the food trail in 2017.

Ms Connors noted that support for food producers, may include, improved marketing, product quality and business skills through support for innovative collaborative processes and so address challenges to co-operation identified in studies on facilitating short supply chains e.g. entry barriers, the need for shared understanding, skills/training, and marketing and business skills deficits.

- In reply to a query it was advised that the mentoring in previous years was funded through CEDRA and that an application has been submitted again this year.
- It was advised that the festival has a part time CEO and one full time admin person.
- The proposed number of hours 720 and the fact that the person has already done this work for the festival was considered an issue by the Evaluation Committee as they considered it a job.

- Mr Jimmy Taaffe noted that the concerns regarding the procurement for the consultancy services were raised with the promoters.
- A Committee Member expressed the opinion that the funding spent on print, media and photography was excessive. The brochure is way too elaborate. The thickness of the paper and the cost associated with translating everything into Irish brings unnecessary costs for a volunteer body. Reference was made to the brochure used for the Kilkenny festival as being more appropriate and also that there should be a move to digital online promotion rather than paper brochure.
- Ms Connors advised that the festival is promoted digitally noting that the food trails extends into the Gaeltacht area. Moving the goal post on these elements will require the promoter to re-tender thereby missing the call deadline. A number of visitors keep their copy of the brochure as a keepsake as it details stories about the food producers.
- Other Committee Members stated that they thought the brochure is a good advertisement for the county noting that the festival has significant importance and is well known nationally.
- It was clarified that the bus hire included a collect and drop service from designated surrounding pick up points.
- A discussion ensued on the advertising in newspapers and on the radio and if the costs were justified. The value returned for the investment must be looked at. Ms Connors read out some of the stats compiled outlining the cost, value and reach for each of the different forms of advertising.
- The catering event were fully sold out but had an occupancy rate of 78%.
- The amount of promotion both Ms Eunice Power and Mr Paul Flynn do on behalf of the County was noted.
- Advertising on one of the Cork radios was queried as its listeners are very young. The high number of young people in their twenties and early thirties with young families that visit and attend the outdoor events each year was commented on. Ms Connors replied that the promoters had to obtain quotations from broadcasters with similar coverage for comparison of costs.
- Ms Connors advised the Evaluation Committee of a point raised by the WLP Financial Controller "if the amount of funding, subject to approval from WLP is reduced by the cost of the consultancy fees then the projected profit of €2,770, as per the business plan, would turn into a loss of €9,380".
- A Committee Member stated that the printing, media and photography should be reviewed to see what works and what doesn't work as the amount being spent is extremely high in all these areas. Committee Members noted that this could be said to the promoter for consideration for next year's festival rather than inserting it as a condition this year.

The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend funding this project with the following conditions:-

- The consultancy element of the application should not be funded as it has procurement issues and considered as employment rather than a defined service.

- **A maximum of €33,048.15 or 75% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.**

Amount Recommended: € €33,048.15

75% of Eligible Project Funding: €44,064.20

Signed: _____

Signed: _____

Chairperson of Evaluation Committee

Committee Member

Date: _____

Date: _____

Issues / Queries raised by Evaluation Committee	Project Officers Response

Signed: _____

Dated: _____

WLP Project Officer

Please insert photos below of reference purposes:

(for example a photo of the building to be renovated/machinery being purchased, etc)

Denise Walsh

From: John Harnedy <johnjharnedy@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday 6 November 2018 16:48
To: Denise Walsh
Subject: Re: WLP draft minutes

Hi,

I am in agreement with the draft minutes sent.

Regards,

John

On Tue 6 Nov 2018 at 15:44, Denise Walsh <Denise.Walsh@wlp.ie> wrote:

Hi John,

Attached please find the draft minutes for you to review.

If you are in agreement I need you to reply back stating that you are in agreement with the minutes as drafted. A copy of that email then goes with the decision sheet and score card to the LCDC.

Thanks & Regards,

Denise Walsh

Administrator / Riarthóir

Waterford Leader Partnership CLG

Lismore Business Park,

Mayfield,

Lismore,

Co. Waterford.

LEADER Food

Initiative Evaluation Committee Scoresheet

Projects will be evaluated based on the following score criteria and assessment will be based on a maximum score of 100 and will be divided as outlined below (this replaces Appendix 11 of the LEADER 2014 – 2020 Operating Rules Consolidated updated Version 2):

Score Criteria	Weighting	Min Score
Does the project fit with the Local Development Strategy?	Pass/Fail	Pass
Does the project comply with eligibility criteria as set out in the LEADER Operating Rules?	Pass/Fail	Pass
Deadweight: Does the project actually require LEADER funding to proceed?	Pass/Fail	Pass
Displacement/Competition: Will the project be in direct competition with an existing local business and could it result in displacement of jobs or activities elsewhere?	Pass/Fail	Pass
Registered Food Producer: If the project applicant is a food producer, are they a registered food producer with the relevant Competent Authority as per Regulation (EC) No 852/2004	Pass/Fail	Pass
Innovation and Alignment with the LEADER Food Initiative Areas of funding outlined in Section 3: Has the project applicant demonstrated how the project plans to address emerging challenges through investment in market development/competitiveness and /or innovation?	20	15
Project Impacts: Has the project applicant demonstrated how the project will deliver social, economic and/or environmental added value?	20	15
Sustainability of the project: Does the business/project plan demonstrate that the project is viable and sustainable in to the future?	20	17
Applicant Background, Skills and Experience: Has the project applicant demonstrated that it has the skills and experience necessary to ensure the project is a success?	15	13
Financial Viability: Has the project applicant demonstrated the projects value for money and the projects financial viability from development through to operation?	15	12
Market: What evidence has been provided that the project is filling an identified need, market or demand?	10	8
TOTAL	100	80

Recommendations of the Evaluation Committee:

The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend funding this project with the following condition: - The consultancy element of the application shall not be funded. A maximum of € €33,048.15 or 75% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.
--

Signature: 
Signature of Evaluation Committee Chair

Date: 05/4/2018

