



Comhpháirtíocht Leader Waterford Leader
Phort Láirge Partnership

Decision of Evaluation Committee

Project ID	31LDRWAT108652
Project Type:	Capital
Project Name:	Waterford Camino E-Biking
Promoters Name:	Waterford Camino E-Biking (WCeB)
Address:	8 Chestnut Dr, Viewmount Pk, Waterford
Description:	The unique selling point of this project is the ability to go to the client and cycle where they wish to go. This means there are endless 'start points' and unlimited places to visit and cycle. The capability to bring the E-bikes to the customer will ensure the project is a market leader in custom E-biking tours, with competent guides, who are themselves serious cycling enthusiasts. The project will have a secure storage facility at Dunphy's of Dunhill but will provide a meet and greet service to the client. It will be the first major supplier of quality trail/hybrid electric assist bikes in Ireland. The company aims to promote the attractions of Waterford and the South East Coast, utilising the new cycling routes.
Theme:	Rural Tourism
Sub-theme:	Activity Tourism
Link to LDS	Lo1 Rural Tourism and Strategic Action 1.1 Activity Tourism

Total Project Costs	€51,735		
Eligible Project Costs	€51,735		
Funding sought by promoter:	€17,273.30		
Funding recommended by Evaluation Committee:	€0		
Details of private funding:	€57,000 Loan finance		
Voluntary Labour: YES / NO (If yes provide detail)	Yes		
Synopsis of project:	Funding sought to purchase 15 electric hybrid/trail E-bike, box trailer and associated equipment including marketing support, signage and safety equipment		
Detail exactly what WLP will be funding (List items from Project Assessment Report)	Detail	Total Cost (Expenditure)	Grant Aid recommend by the Evaluation Committee @ 0%
	E bikes; purchase of up to 15	28,955	0

	Box trailers; purchase of up to 2 secure single or twin axle	10,578	
	Safety Equipment; 2 x first aid kits, 1 x mobile defibrillator	1,737	
	Marketing Website; commerce website, logo, marketing design	4,500	
	Print Branding; business cards, headed paper, fliers, maps, posters	565.68	
	Branded Products; display banners, water bottles, ponchos, hi vis vests	1,871	
	Digital Marketing; Facebook, Twitter	2,565	
	Signage; mobile x 4	963	
Total costs		€51,735	€0
Was an assessment completed?: Date: <u>30th Jan '19</u>	Yes		
Are detailed costings provided for the project? Were the costs for the project considered reasonable and how was this measured?	Yes, direct tendering used to invite suppliers and most economic advantageous tender process used to select chosen suppliers		
Where the procurement process resulted in less than 3 quotes, the EC must show the additional steps taken to ensure the reasonableness of costs:	Evidence was provided of the required number of suppliers invited to tender despite some companies not quoting		
Innovative Element of the project:	The unique selling point of this project is the ability to go to the client and cycle where they wish to go. This means there are endless 'start points' and unlimited places to visit and cycle		
Consideration of Deadweight:	The promoter would not be in a position to progress this project without grant support as it is dependent on funding to kick start the business.		
Consideration of Displacement:	This project will not compete or impact on any similar venture. While some		

	existing bike hire companies hire E bikes, they do not provide a turn up and hire business. This project proposes a high end guided tour business.
Economic justification for project:	There are a number of E-Bike rental providers in Ireland but none are focusing on trail/hybrid E-bikes and this is where the gap in the market has been identified. Therefore it will compliment existing bike hire companies and form alliances.
Average Score for Project:	41/100
% level of aid & ceiling:	A maximum of €0 or 0% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.
E. C. Executive Summary/Rationale for Funding	The Evaluation agreed to recommend to the Waterford LCDC not to fund this project as presented for the following reasons:- - The Committee did not consider the project viable. - Project did not score the required 65% to be recommended for approval. A maximum of €0 or 0% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.

Jobs Created	Jobs Sustained	Match Funding	Previous Grant Aid Received
1ft & 2-4 seasonal	1Ft	€57,000 loan finance	€0

Confirmation that agencies / communities are supportive of the proposed project.	Date of Confirmation	Signed By
LEO	16th Jan '19	Brid Kirby
Failte Ireland	11th Jan '19	Sarah Fitzpatrick

Detail of Discussion: The main points raised in the discussion of this project were:-

- Ms Claire Connors advised that the promoter Michael Garland has been involved with various organisations including Waterford & Tramore Chamber of Commerce and SOLAS. He also set up Waterford Business Group and is a consultant to a lot of businesses. He is an avid cyclist and very involved with Waterford Camino Tours a company set up by two friends of his in April 2017. They offer a package type operation whereby they will bring in people for cycling tours but will organise all travel, accommodation, etc. From his interact with this company and his experience with cycling he has identified a gap in the market for hybrid trail e-bikes capable of tackling Waterford's tracks and trails and enables people to experience difficult terrain and hilly areas.
- He is proposing to purchase 15 bikes that will be stored in Dunhill & Annestown in a lock up storage. It was noted that for the Dunhill storage he has a letter of undertaking for the use of the unit but there is no guarantee that the facility will not be withdrawn.
- The promoter will develop a meet and greet package and will bring the bikes to the customer at an agreed starting point.
- The Committee noted that they were unsure about the number of tracks in Co Waterford. Ms Connors advised that the routes will be off greenway but mostly road routes as identified by Failte Ireland in their guide to cycle routes in Co Waterford. There are numerous ones between Dungarvan and West Waterford. Some areas like Knockanore are particularly hilly and these bikes will be ideal.

- A discussion ensued on the proposed name and if the Spanish Camino should be used. It was advised that St Declan's Way is officially linked to the Camino and that you will get your stamp if completed.
- The bikes are a mountain bike and the tyres can be changed to allow access to rougher terrain.
- The type of trailer being purchased for transporting the bikes was queried as others tend to use specialised trailers capable of storing each bike individually. It was noted that the bikes are fairly robust with slim fitting batteries.
- The varied background of the promoter was also discussed with it being noted that he is putting very little of his own funds into the project.
- The Evaluation Committee discussed the job creation proposed agreeing that it does not add up. The promoter will not run a business of the scale projected with 15 bikes while travelling all over the County delivering the bikes to potential customers. Often groups will be less than 15 and not all bikes will be hired out. Ms Connors advised that initially the project will create full time employment for the promoter.
- The Committee noted that ideally the promoter would have been better placed to work in partnership with one of the existing bike hire companies. Ms Connors advised that originally that was the intention but during the application process the promoter advised that he had secured the storage unit in Dunhill and was proceeding with the application himself.
- A discussion ensued on the application and the Evaluation Committee agreed the following:-
 - o It is not a well presented application
 - o The finances don't add up
 - o Promoter is taking out higher loans and reducing grant aid
 - o Project income is unrealistic with 15 bikes
 - o No provision in projections for paying for additional guides
 - o Financial projects don't include loan repayments
 - o Business plan is poor
 - o Logistics not feasible – delivering and collecting bikes all over County.

The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend not funding this project as presented as they did not consider the project viable.

Recommendation: A maximum of €0 or 0 % of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser

Amount Recommended: 0

0% of Eligible Project Funding:

Signed: _____

Signed: _____

Chairperson of Evaluation Committee

Committee Member

Date: _____

Date: _____

Issues / Queries raised by Evaluation Committee	Project Officers Response

Signed: Claire Connors

Dated: 26th Feb '19

WLP Project Officer

Please insert photos below of reference purposes:

(for example a photo of the building to be renovated/machinery being purchased, etc)

Overall Evaluation Committee Scoring Record

Date: 11th Feb 2019

Time: 11am to 3pm

Project Title: Waterford Camino E-Biking

Project Reference Number: 31LDRWAT108652

Assessment Criteria	Objective	Issues raised by Evaluation Committee	Weighting	Score
Compatibility with Local Development Strategy	Do the project proposals meet the criteria set out in the LAG business plan for the relevant measure?		Yes / No	
Innovation	Is the product innovative in its nature and does it displace existing enterprises? - Product / Service 9/19 <u>4</u> - Displacement 5/19 <u>3</u> - Job Creation 5/19 <u>3</u>		19	10
Promoters experience	Does the promoter have the training/skills, track record or experience to deliver? - Standards of Operation 6/25 <u>3</u> - Track Record 6/25 <u>3</u> - Structure of Business 6/25 <u>3</u> - Necessary skills base 7/25 <u>3</u>		25	12
Financial Viability	Are the project costs justifiable (reasonableness of costs) and / is funding available to co-fund the project? - Overall Costs 7/25 <u>3</u> - Co Funding 6/25 <u>1</u> - Financial Plan 6/25 <u>1</u>		25	10

	Deadweight	6/25	5		
Sustainability	Is the project viable and will the service continue to be delivered?			13	4
Requirement	Does the proposal target a specific need or address a specific gap in the market?			18	5
Total				100	41

N.B. Project must receive a minimum score of 65% prior to being recommended for approval.

- Has the potential level of deadweight been assessed for this project? YES / ~~NO~~
- i.e. would the project proceed without LEADER funding? YES / ~~NO~~

Recommendations of the Evaluation Committee: Refused

Signature: 

Signature of Evaluation Committee Chair

Date: 11th February 2018

Denise Walsh

From: pclerkin@cablesurf.com
Sent: Tuesday 19 February 2019 15:28
To: Denise Walsh
Subject: Draft Minutes of Evaluation Committee Meeting on 11th February 2019.

Hi Denise,

I have reviewed the draft minutes of this meeting and i am fully in agreement with them.

Regards,

Paul Clerkin

