



Comhpháirtíocht Leader Waterford Leader
Phort Láirge Partnership

Decision of Evaluation Committee

Project ID	31LDRWAT110525
Project Type:	Enterprise, Food
Project Name:	Knockanore Farmhouse Cheese Co. Ltd
Promoters Name:	Knockanore Farmhouse Cheese Co. Ltd
Address:	Ballyneety, Knockanore, Co. Waterford
Description:	The project involves the extension to the cheese making facility and the purchase of new machinery to increase production capacity in a cost effective and efficient manner.
Theme:	Local Objective 2, Enterprise,
Sub-theme:	Strategic Action 2.2 Food
Link to LDS	Local Objective 2, Enterprise

Total Project Costs	€400,355.00		
Eligible Project Costs	€400,355.00		
Funding sought by promoter:	€182,775 or 45.653%, whichever is the lesser amount		
State one of the following: - First Review / Previously Deferred or Not Recommend	Second Review as the recommendation was deferred for Further Information on Employment Numbers and Salaries		
Funding recommended by Evaluation Committee:	€159,020 or 39.7197% of eligible expenditure whichever is the lesser		
Details of private funding:	€104,810 & €66,695.12 cash/money in bank €78,000 Loan/bridging finance		
Voluntary Labour: YES / NO (If yes provide detail)	No		
Synopsis of project:	Extend the range of cheese moving from an artisan producer to a commercial one.		
Detail exactly what WLP will be funding (List items from Project Assessment Report)	Detail	Total Cost (Expenditure)	Grant Aid recommend by the Evaluation Committee @ 39.7197 %
	Peg Mill	24500	9731
	Ice Builder	47500	18867
	Pasteuriser	46000	18271

	Vacuum Extruder(Not been purchased)	(-77155)	(-35,227.20)
	Bowl	38500	15292
	Taping Machine	2650	1053
	Automated Cheese Smoker	79960	31760
	Auto labeller	73745	29291
	Rebranding	5000	1986
	Construction	82500	32769
Total Funding		400,355	159,020
Was an assessment completed? Date: _____	The Evaluation Committee agreed that the revised project assessment was completed on the 13 th Sept 2019.		
Are detailed costings provided for the project? Were the costs for the project considered reasonable and how was this measured?	The promoter sought and received quotations for each item under Category 2 of the LEADER Rules. 5 Quotations for the Building. The Promoter retendered for the Cheese Smoker		
Where the procurement process resulted in less than 3 quotes, the EC must show the additional steps taken to ensure the reasonableness of costs:	Where this occurred, there is email evidence to demonstrate that reasonable efforts were made to obtain relevant quotations.		
Innovative Element of the project:	The investment will assist in increasing production capacity in a cost effective and efficient manner in a family owned alternative enterprise that has been built from scratch.		
Consideration of Deadweight:	The Evaluation Committee agreed that deadweight is not an issue as without funding this project will proceed at a much lesser level.		
Consideration of Displacement:	Displacement is not an issue as the number of commercial artisan manufacturing operating in the promoter's area of operation is limited.		
Economic justification for project:	The project fits in with the Co Waterford LCDC Plan for enterprise projects.		
Average Score for Project:	81/100		
% level of aid & ceiling:	€159,020 or 39.7197% of eligible expenditure whichever is the lesser		
E. C. Executive Summary/Rationale for Funding	The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend funding this project for the following reasons: - 1. The majority of the Evaluation Committee agreed that funding this project will help the promoter enhance the sustainability of the business and allow it to diversify its product range for new market opportunities.		

Jobs Created	Jobs Sustained	Match Funding	Previous Grant Aid Received
2 - 3	6 Fulltime	Yes	Yes – 2007 -2013 LEADER Programme
	3 Part Time		
	1 Seasonal		

Confirmation that agencies / communities are supportive of the proposed project.	Date of Confirmation	Signed By
Waterford LEO confirmed that there was no Duplication or issue with De Minimus	22/05/2019	B. Kirby

The following were the main points raised in the discussion of the project: -

- Mr Jimmy Taaffe advised that this project was already recommended and approved for funding. It is being looked at again as the promoter has requested to change one machine, a vacuum extruder for another machine an automated cheese smoker due to further detailed analysis.
- It was noted that the requested change will not change the overall % rate granted. The piece of equipment is about €2,000 cheaper
- The Evaluation Committee all agreed to recommend the proposed change as requested noting that the original scoring and rational for approval remains in place.

Previously the Evaluation Committee on the 14th June 2019 recommended the following: -

- Following an in-depth discussion around job creation and the possibility of removing elements of the proposal from funding it was agreed to reduce funding to 40% of eligible expenditure up to a maximum of €159,020, whichever is the lesser.

The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend this project with the following conditions: -

- Funding reduced to a maximum of 39.7197% or €159,020.00 whichever is the lesser.
- Any change to the proposed equipment should not increase the above % or maximum funding received as previously recommended.

The Evaluation Committee recommended a maximum of 39.7197% or €159,020 of eligible expenditure which ever is the lesser.

Amount Recommended: A maximum of €159,020 or 39.7197% of eligible expenditure whichever is the lesser.	39.7197% of Eligible Project Funding:€159,020 Of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.
---	--

Signed: _____ Signed: _____

Chairperson of Evaluation Committee

Committee Member

Date: _____ Date: _____

Issues / Queries raised by Evaluation Committee	Project Officers Response
The 39.7197% is based on a full investment of the €397550	This will be put in the Letter of Offer
Salary Levels	Funding reduced to 39.7197%

Signed: _____

Dated: _____

WLP Project Officer

Please insert photos below of reference purposes:

(for example, a photo of the building to be renovated/machinery being purchased, etc.)



Overall Evaluation Committee Scoring Record

Date: 14th June 2019

Time: 9am

Project Title: Knockanore Farmhouse Cheese

Project Reference Number: 31LDRWAT110525

Assessment Criteria	Objective	Issues raised by Evaluation Committee	Weighting	Score
Compatibility with Local Development Strategy	Do the project proposals meet the criteria set out in the LAG business plan for the relevant measure?		Yes / No	
Innovation	Is the product innovative in its nature and does it displace existing enterprises? - Product / Service 9/19 _____ - Displacement 5/19 _____ - Job Creation 5/19 _____	19		15
Promoters experience	Does the promoter have the training/skills, track record or experience to deliver? - Standards of Operation 6/25 _____ - Track Record 6/25 _____ - Structure of Business 6/25 _____ - Necessary skills base 7/25 _____	25		21
Financial Viability	Are the project costs justifiable (reasonableness of costs) and / is funding available to co-fund the project? - Overall Costs 7/25 _____ - Co Funding 6/25 _____ - Financial Plan 6/25 _____	25		20

	Deadweight	6/25		
Sustainability	Is the project viable and will the service continue to be delivered?		13	10
Requirement	Does the proposal target a specific need or address a specific gap in the market?		18	15
Total			100	25

N.B. Project must receive a minimum score of 65% prior to being recommended for approval.

- Has the potential level of deadweight been assessed for this project? YES / ~~NO~~
- i.e. would the project proceed without LEADER funding? YES / NO

Recommendations of the Evaluation Committee: Approved

Signature: [Signature]

Signature of Evaluation Committee Chair

Date: 14th Feb, 2018

Denise Walsh

From: pclerkin@cablesurf.com
Sent: Sunday 20 October 2019 14:27
To: Denise Walsh
Subject: Draft minutes of Evaluation Committee meeting on 11th October 2019.

Hi Denise,

I have reviewed the above draft minutes and I am in agreement with them.

Regards

Paul Clerkin

