



Comhpháirtíocht Leader Waterford Leader  
Phort Láirge Partnership

### Decision of Evaluation Committee

|                        |                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Project ID</b>      | 31LDRWAT110720                                                                                                                                                                               |
| <b>Project Type:</b>   | Capital                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| <b>Project Name:</b>   | Restoration of Clonegam Church, Portlaw                                                                                                                                                      |
| <b>Promoters Name:</b> | Fiddown Union of Parishes                                                                                                                                                                    |
| <b>Address:</b>        | Clonegam, Portlaw, Co. Waterford                                                                                                                                                             |
| <b>Description:</b>    | Preservation of Clonegam Church will ensure that the valuable relics contained within, will be protected from the elements and shared with visitors as part of Portlaw's heritage experience |
| <b>Theme:</b>          | LO1 Rural Tourism                                                                                                                                                                            |
| <b>Sub-theme:</b>      | SA1.2 Culture & Heritage Product Development                                                                                                                                                 |
| <b>Link to LDS</b>     |                                                                                                                                                                                              |

|                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                     |                                                                  |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Total Project Costs</b>                                                                         | €47,670                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                     |                                                                  |
| <b>Eligible Project Costs</b>                                                                      | €47,670                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                     |                                                                  |
| <b>Funding sought by promoter:</b>                                                                 | €35,752.50                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                     |                                                                  |
| <b>State one of the following: -<br/>First Review / Previously Deferred<br/>or Not Recommend</b>   | Previously Deferred                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                     |                                                                  |
| <b>Funding recommended by<br/>Evaluation Committee:</b>                                            | €35,752.50                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                     |                                                                  |
| <b>Details of private funding:</b>                                                                 | €11,917.50                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                     |                                                                  |
| <b>Voluntary Labour: YES / NO (If yes<br/>provide detail)</b>                                      | No                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                     |                                                                  |
| <b>Synopsis of project:</b>                                                                        | To carry out essential weather proofing to the protected Clonegam Church in Portlaw in order to bring cultural visitors to view the relics contained within and add to the tourism offering in Portlaw |                                     |                                                                  |
| <b>Detail exactly what WLP will be<br/>funding (List items from Project<br/>Assessment Report)</b> | <b>Detail</b>                                                                                                                                                                                          | <b>Total Cost<br/>(Expenditure)</b> | <b>Grant Aid recommend by the<br/>Evaluation Committee @ 75%</b> |
|                                                                                                    | Restoration work                                                                                                                                                                                       | €47,670                             | €35,752.50                                                       |
|                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                     |                                                                  |
|                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                     |                                                                  |
| <b>Total Funding</b>                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                        | <b>€47,670</b>                      | <b>€35,752.50</b>                                                |
| <b>Was an assessment completed?:<br/>Date: __27/08/19__</b>                                        | Yes                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                     |                                                                  |
| <b>Are detailed costings provided for<br/>the project? Were the costs for the</b>                  | Yes, direct tendering was used and the contractor chosen on the lowest value tender                                                                                                                    |                                     |                                                                  |

|                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>project considered reasonable and how was this measured?</b>                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| <b>Where the procurement process resulted in less than 3 quotes, the EC must show the additional steps taken to ensure the reasonableness of costs:</b> | Not applicable. Five contractors submitted prices as per National procurement Guidelines                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| <b>Innovative Element of the project:</b>                                                                                                               | The building contains some priceless relics that will hugely appeal to the culturally curious particularly one monument which dates from 1873 dedicated to Florence Grosvenor Rowley, wife of the fifth marquis of Waterford. The marchioness died in 1873 during childbirth and her grief-stricken husband commissioned the monument, designed by an eminent Austrian artist. The monument is in Kilkenny marble and sits cleverly in a wall niche, lit by a skylight in the roof above |
| <b>Consideration of Deadweight:</b>                                                                                                                     | Promoter would not be in a position to carry out this essential works without access to grant support                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| <b>Consideration of Displacement:</b>                                                                                                                   | Displacement is not an issue as the support of the church will add to the visitor experience in Portlaw                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| <b>Economic justification for project:</b>                                                                                                              | The project will attract visitor groups by appointment and will add value to the existing visitor experience of Portlaw as a heritage village. The village has a small number of grocery shops, butchers and a café that will benefit greatly from the additional footfall.                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| <b>Average Score for Project:</b>                                                                                                                       | The project scored 75/100 (1)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| <b>% level of aid &amp; ceiling:</b>                                                                                                                    | A maximum of €35,752.50 or 75% of eligible expenditure whichever is the lesser                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| <b>E. C. Executive Summary/Rationale for Funding</b>                                                                                                    | <p><b>The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend funding this project for the following reasons:-</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>1. The project scored 75/100</b></li> <li><b>2. The project fits the Co Waterford Local Development Strategy for Cultural Tourism.</b></li> </ol> <p><b>A maximum of €35,752.50 or 75% of eligible expenditure whichever is the lesser</b></p>                                                                                     |

| <b>Jobs Created</b> | <b>Jobs Sustained</b> | <b>Match Funding</b> | <b>Previous Grant Aid Received</b> |
|---------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|------------------------------------|
| 0                   | 0                     | €11,917.50 in house  | €0                                 |

| <b>Confirmation that agencies / communities are supportive of the proposed project.</b> | <b>Date of Confirmation</b> | <b>Signed By</b>  |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------|
| Local Enterprise Office                                                                 | 5/9/19                      | Brid Kirby        |
| Faillte Ireland                                                                         | 12/9/19                     | Sarah Fitzpatrick |
|                                                                                         |                             |                   |

**The following were the main points raised in the discussion of the project on the 6.12.19: -**

- Ms Claire Connors advised that the promoter's response was circulated by email to the Evaluation Committee.
- The Evaluation Committee noted that they still had doubts about the project as it has no lease in place and the committee membership is limited.
- Ms Claire Connors advised that the lease is in motion and will be in place shortly and that the promoters have widened the membership and included the Portlaw Heritage Group as requested. The new Committee will be called The Friends of Clonagam.
- The Committee said that they were not happy with the Committee as its mostly representatives of the Church body. It was noted that it does not look like a community group and that it should have a broader representation.
- Ms Connors advised that originally the promoters were asked to have representatives of the Portlaw Heritage Group on the Committee which they have now done. Both Mr Gerard Crotty and Mr Alan Walsh are members of the Portlaw Heritage. Mr Alan Walsh is a member of the elected committee and Mr Gerard Walsh will be a committee member.
- Ms Connor said that other groups are not there and that it is proving awfully difficult in Portlaw to get people involved in community projects. It is planned to hold capacity building training in the New Year.
- The Evaluation Committee stated that the memberships should be more weighted to the Portlaw Heritage Group rather than the Church representatives but agreed that the Committee as stated will be the main drivers of the project and responsible for getting it done.
- When responding to the Promoters, we must be clear about our requirements as they have already done as asked by adding members from the Portlaw Heritage group said Ms. Connors
- The Evaluation Committee expressed the opinion that it is a worthwhile project, and one they would like to support, but referenced other projects where they insisted on a community group being the promoters. The Red Hall in Lismore being a very successful example and it is being widely used.
- A general discussion ensued on committees and if they are considered a formal entity. It was confirmed that they are not but that the rules allow the funding of a formalised committee group.
- Given the lack of community groups in Portlaw the Committee queried if what they were looking for was attainable in this instance? Mr Jimmy Taaffe said that there are other groups such as the Tidy Towns and that other members could be obtained.
- The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend funding the project with the following conditions: -
  - The Lease must be in place prior to payment.
  - A fairer balance of membership must be obtained by adding a minimum of two members from the Portlaw Heritage Group or from a local Community group.

**A maximum of €35,752.50 or 75% of eligible expenditure whichever is the lesser for the following reasons: -**

- **The project scored 75/100**
- **The project fits the Co Waterford Local Development Strategy for Cultural Tourism.**

**Previous Evaluation on the 11.10.19**

The following were the main points raised in the discussion of the project: -

- Ms Claire Connors advised that the promoters have reverted by email noting that they can see the Evaluation Committee's point about being vested in the community. They are proposing that for phase two of the project a separate committee called Friends of Clonagam Committee will be set up consisting of two members from the church, two members from Curraghmore and two members from the Heritage Group.
- For phase one this application it is only about making the premises weather tight and secure the heritage contained within. The new arrangement will be put in place for phase two which will be about providing the services, lighting, heating, etc and opening as a tourist facility.
- It was confirmed that the building belongs to the Church of Ireland and not Curraghmore.

- The Evaluation Committee noted that their concern was how to ensure that the community benefited from funding. Citing the Red Hall in Lismore as an example of where the premises were vested in the community and how successful this has been. It is currently being used for lots of different activities.
- The Evaluation Committee agreed the project has huge potential and is well worth preserving.
- A discussion ensued and it was agreed that a precedent has been set whereby all similar type projects had to be invested in the community and that they don't see how they could make an exception for this one. To date only projects invested in the community has been funded to ensure that they are open to all comers.

The Evaluation Committee agreed to defer this project to see if the promoters will accelerate the formation of the Friends of Clonagam Committee saying that funding can only go to non-denominational organisation that includes people from the Portlaw Heritage Group and the Local Community.

**Amount Recommended: €35,752.50**

**75% of Eligible Project Funding: €47,670**

Signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Chairperson of Evaluation Committee

Committee Member

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

| Issues / Queries raised by Evaluation Committee | Project Officers Response |
|-------------------------------------------------|---------------------------|
|                                                 |                           |
|                                                 |                           |
|                                                 |                           |
|                                                 |                           |

Signed: Claire Connors

Dated: 12/12/19

WLP Project Officer

Please insert photos below of reference purposes:





## Denise Walsh

---

**From:** pclerkin@cablesurf.com  
**Sent:** Monday 16 December 2019 14:42  
**To:** Denise Walsh  
**Subject:** Evaluation Committee Meeting on 6th December 2019

Denise,

I am in agreement with the draft minutes.

Regards

Paul Clerkin

