



Comhpháirtíocht Leader Waterford Leader
Phort Láirge Partnership

Decision of Evaluation Committee

Project ID	31LDRWAT115777
Project Type:	Capital
Project Name:	Ballyconnery Bó- Direct to consumer milk business
Promoters Name:	Ballyconnery Bó
Address:	Currabaha, Colligan, Dungarvan, Co. Waterford
Description:	This business will be the first of its kind in County Waterford, supplying fresh, high quality pasteurised and non homogenised milk direct to the consumer through a unique vending machine process. The consumer will see first hand where the milk is produced from the family herd and will be available throughout the day and evening.
Theme:	LO2
Sub-theme:	SA2.2 LEADER Food Initiative
Link to LDS	Supporting local artisan food producers

Total Project Costs	€71,734.67		
Eligible Project Costs	€71,734.67		
Funding sought by promoter:	€53,801		
State one of the following: - First Review / Previously Deferred or Not Recommend	First Review		
Funding recommended by Evaluation Committee:	€0		
Details of private funding:	€17,933.67 Loan finance		
Voluntary Labour: YES / NO (If yes provide detail)	No		
Synopsis of project:	Funding towards a milk vending operation and associated costs at John and Carmel Kiely's Ballyconnery Farm near Colligan Wood		
Detail exactly what WLP will be funding (List items from Project Assessment Report)	Detail	Total Cost (Expenditure)	Grant Aid recommend by the Evaluation Committee @ 75%
	Milkstation	17,307.20	0
	Milkstation	7,830	0
	Unison	20,670	0
	Unison	8,100	0
	ATEC	3,328.47	0

	Trihy's	4,065	0
	ESB Networks	10,434	0
Total Funding			€0
Was an assessment completed?: Date: 1st Dec 2021	Yes		
Are detailed costings provided for the project? Were the costs for the project considered reasonable and how was this measured?	Yes the project was etendered and the smaller items directly invited to quote and the most economic advantageous tender process used to select the chosen suppliers		
Where the procurement process resulted in less than 3 quotes, the EC must show the additional steps taken to ensure the reasonableness of costs:	Comparison quotes available as the project was etendered and smaller items provided by suppliers directly invited by email		
Innovative Element of the project:	The uniqueness of the project given it is the first milk vending machine in this area offering the customer first hand experience of getting their non homogenized milk		
Consideration of Deadweight:	The promoter would not be in a position to invest in this vending machine in the near future without access to funding		
Consideration of Displacement:	There is no other similar project to this proposal within County Waterford. The nearest most recent development is in Wexford.		
Economic justification for project:	The project would provide another outlet for its milk with the hope of developing into other dairy produce		
Average Score for Project:	55/100		
% level of aid & ceiling:	A maximum of €0 or 0% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser		
E. C. Executive Summary/Rationale for Funding	The Evaluation Committee agreed not to recommend funding this project for the following reasons:- 1) The project scored 55 and not the minimum 65 required to be considered recommended for approval. 2) The location of the business was considered too remote. 3) The project was not considered viable.		

Jobs Created	Jobs Sustained	Match Funding	Previous Grant Aid Received
1.5	1.5	€17,933.67 Loan finance	€0

Confirmation on the applicant's position re De-Minibus and double from the relevant agencies.	Date of Confirmation	Signed By
Brid Kirby, Local Enterprise Office	8 th Nov '21	Brid Kirby

The following were the main points raised in the discussion of the project: -

- Ms Claire Connors briefly outlined the background of the promoters who are looking to diversify off farm by selling fresh dairy produce directly to the consumer on-site. They intend to invest in pasteurisation equipment

and a milk vending machine. Consumers will be able to fill and refill glass bottles with milk and flavoured milk that has been produced and pasteurised on site. Johnnie Kiely has been running the family farm for the past 15 years and his wife Carmel is a qualified teacher, and they plan to run it together.

- It is intended that the vending machine will be manned from 8am to 3pm and will be self service after that so will be available to customers all day. There will be lights and CCTV. The Committee noted that there would have to be ample provision for parking and lights to ensure proper health and safety standards.
- A discussion took place on staffing as both promoters work either on the farm or teaching. Ms. Connors advised that Ms Kiely intended to take a step back from teaching until the project was established.
- The Evaluation Committee discussed the location of the project, nearby Colligan, noting that it is quite remote from Dungarvan and questioned if enough people will travel 5 to 7 miles daily just to purchase milk.
- Ms Connors advised that in time the promoters intended to have an on-farm shop, selling yogurt, cheese, etc. It was pointed out that having the on-farm shop prior to this might have established a market. All Committee Members expressed doubts about getting enough people out from Dungarvan daily to make the business profitable.
- The cost of the product was also considered expensive being almost twice the price of shop bought milk. The first 1ltr bottle will be €2.50 with refills at €1.50 per bottle.
- It was noted that while the promoters state that the product is non-homogenised, they did not outline the benefits of it.
- Ms Connors advised that the promoters intend to capitalise on the novelty of going on farm to get product and sell the overall experience. It will be unique in Co Waterford as high quality pasteurised and non-homogenised milk is not currently available.
- The Committee kept referring to the remote location and a discussion ensued on the possibility of a mobile shack attending markets and event would be a viable solution. It noted this is not possible as the pasteurization needs to be done on site. Three phases electricity is needed to drive the bulk tanks.
- Similar operations in Co Louth and Wexford are better located to bigger centres population.
- The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend not funding this project for the following reasons:
 - 1) The project scored 55 and not the minimum 65 required to be considered recommended for approval.
 - 2) The location of the business was considered too remote.
 - 3) The project was not considered viable.

Amount Recommended: €0

75% of Eligible Project Funding: €71,734.67

Signed: _____

Signed: _____

Chairperson of Evaluation Committee

Committee Member

Date: _____

Date: _____

Issues / Queries raised by Evaluation Committee	Project Officers Response

Signed: Claire Connors

Dated: ____13th December 2021__

WLP Project Officer

Please insert photos below of reference purposes:



Evaluation Committee Scoring Record

Date: 8/21/2021

Time: 2:30 pm

Project Title: Billyconney BS

Project Reference Number: 31408 WAT15777

Assessment Criteria	Objective	Issues raised by Evaluation Committee	Weighting	Score
Compatibility with Local Development Strategy	Do the project proposals meet the criteria set out in the LAG business plan for the relevant measure?		Yes / No	
Innovation	Is the product innovative in its nature and does it displace existing enterprises? - Product / Service 9/19 <u>3</u> - Displacement 5/19 <u>3</u> - Job Creation 5/19 <u>4</u>		19	14
Promoters experience	Does the promoter have the training/skills, track record or experience to deliver? - Standards of Operation 6/25 <u>4</u> - Track Record 6/25 <u>4</u> - Structure of Business 6/25 <u>4</u> - Necessary skills base 7/25 <u>4</u>		25	16
Financial Viability	Are the project costs justifiable (reasonableness of costs) and / is funding available to co-fund the project? - Overall Costs 7/25 <u>4</u> - Co Funding 6/25 <u>4</u>		25	15

	Financial Plan	6/25	3		
	Deadweight	6/25	4		
Sustainability	Is the project viable and will the service continue to be delivered?			13	5
Requirement	Does the proposal target a specific need or address a specific gap in the market?			18	5
Total				100	55

N.B. Project must receive a minimum score of 65% prior to being recommended for approval.

- Has the potential level of deadweight been assessed for this project? YES / NO
- i.e. would the project proceed without LEADER funding? YES / NO

Recommendations of the Evaluation Committee: NOT RECOMMENDED.

Signature: 

Signature of Evaluation Committee Chair

Date: 08/12/21

Denise Walsh

From: John Harnedy <johnjharnedy@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday 12 December 2021 17:14
To: Denise Walsh
Subject: Re: WLP Evaluation Minutes 8 12 21

I have reviewed the attached minutes, and I am happy with same.
John

On Sun 12 Dec 2021, 17:10 Denise Walsh, <Denise.Walsh@wlp.ie> wrote:
Hi John,

Attached please find the minutes for your to review.

Thanks & Regards,

Denise Walsh
Administrator / Riarthóir
Waterford Leader Partnership CLG
Lismore Business Park,
Mayfield,
Lismore,
Co. Waterford.

Charities Regulatory Authority No.20070748

F: <https://www.facebook.com/WaterfordLeaderPartnership>
T: <https://twitter.com/wlpleader>
P51 XVP6

Ph: 058-54646 / Mobile: 086 823 6664
Email : denise.walsh@wlp.ie<<mailto:denise.walsh@wlp.ie>>

PLEASE LIKE US ON [cid:image001.gif@01D7EF7A.DDEBDDDB0] <<https://www.facebook.com/#!/pages/Waterford-Leader-Partnership-Ltd/314110866284?fref=ts>>

Unsubscribe - Reply and state Unsubscribe

[cid:image002.jpg@01D7EF7A.DDEBDDDB0][cid:image003.png@01D7EF7A.DDEBDDDB0] [cid:image004.png@01D7EF7A.DDEBDDDB0]
[Description: eu-agricultural] [cid:image006.png@01D7EF7A.DDEBDDDB0]

Tá an ríomhphost seo agus aon iatán a ghabhann leis rúnda agus is d'úsáid an té/na ndaoine a bhfuil sé seolta chuige/chucu, amháin é. D'fhéadfadh an t-ábhar a bheith faoi réir ag pribhléid dhlíthúil agus ghairmiúil. Mura seolaí ainmnithe nó ceaptha an ríomhphost seo tú, níor chóir duit an teachtaireacht seo, nó aon mhír de, a úsáid, a scaoileadh, a chóipeáil, a scaipeadh nó a choimeád. Más amhlaidh go bhfuair tú an ríomhphost seo trí earráid nó trí dhearmad, iarrtar ort sin a chur in iúl don seoltóir láithreach bonn, le do thoil agus aon chóip den ríomhphost seo a scriosadh ó do chóra(i)s ríomhaireachta.

Seiceáladh gach iatán le scanóir aimsithe víreas agus ceaptar iad a bheith saor ó víreas. Iarrtar ort áfach, a dheimhniú go ndéanfar gach teachtaireacht a scanadh ar fhaitíos víris, mar nach féidir aon dlíteanas a ghlacadh maidir le haon ionfhabhtú nó damáiste a dhéantar do do chóras ríomhaireachta tríd an ríomhphost seo a fháil.

The information contained in this e-mail and in any attachments is confidential and is designated solely for the

