



Comhpháirtíocht Leader Waterford Leader
Phort Láirge Partnership

Decision of Evaluation Committee

Project ID	31LDRWAT116418
Project Type:	(SA 2.1) Capital Investment in existing and start up technology, graduate orientated rural businesses
Project Name:	Implementation of CNC Machinery at Murphy Larkin Timber Products Door
Promoters Name:	Murphy Larkin Timber Products Ltd
Address:	Unit 4, Riverstown Industrial Estate, Tramore, Co. Waterford.
Description:	Murphy Larkin retail in internal and external doors. The internal doors are subject to fashion and the designs change regularly. Murphy Larkin imports the doors mainly from China. They are planning to purchase a CNC to move into making their own range of doors. The CNC machine will allow import substitution, i.e., the manufacture of the doors in Tramore rather than China, and the machine will allow Murphy Larkin tender for off size tenders in places like hospitals, for fire doors, etc., and commercial builds. Murphy Larkin have taken this decision following a review of opportunities in their business.
Theme:	LO 2 Strategic & Collaborative Investment in Rural Enterprise Development to foster Rural Job Creation in local villages. / EURI (1)
Sub-theme:	(SA 2.1) Capital Investment in existing and start up technology, graduate orientated rural businesses
Link to LDS	LO 2 Strategic & Collaborative Investment in Rural Enterprise Development to foster Rural Job Creation in local villages.

Total Project Costs	€122,550
Eligible Project Costs	€122,550
Funding sought by promoter:	€91,875 or 75% of eligible funding, whichever is the lesser amount
State one of the following: - First Review / Previously Deferred or Not Recommend	First Review
Funding recommended by Evaluation Committee:	€61,275 or 50% of eligible funding whichever is the lesser amount
Details of private funding:	Own Funds

Voluntary Labour: YES / NO (If yes provide detail)	No		
Synopsis of project:	Murphy Larkin retail in internal and external doors. The internal doors are subject to fashion and the designs change regularly. Murphy Larkin imports the doors mainly from China. The CNC machine will allow import substitution, i.e., the manufacture of the doors in Tramore rather than China, and the machine will allow Murphy Larkin tender for off size tenders in places like hospitals, for fire doors, etc., and commercial builds. Murphy Larkin have taken this decision following a review of opportunities in their business.		
Detail exactly what WLP will be funding (List items from Project Assessment Report)	Detail	Total Cost (Expenditure)	Grant Aid recommend by the Evaluation Committee @ %
	CNC Machine	€122,500	€61,750 or 50% of eligible funding, whichever is the lesser amount
Total Funding			
Was an assessment completed?: Date: <u>24/11/2021</u>	Yes The Evaluation Committee agreed that the project assessment was completed on the 24 th November 2021		
Are detailed costings provided for the project? Were the costs for the project considered reasonable and how was this measured?	The Evaluation Committee agreed that the promoters followed Category 1 – National Procurement Guidelines		
Where the procurement process resulted in less than 3 quotes, the EC must show the additional steps taken to ensure the reasonableness of costs:	The Evaluation Committee agreed that the promoters followed Category 1 – National Procurement Guidelines		
Innovative Element of the project:	The project will allow the applicant, Murphy Larkin to diversify, and reduce their dependency on imported product.		
Consideration of Deadweight:	The Evaluation Committee agreed to reduce funding to 50% to address any deadweight issues. They wanted to help sustain the 14 jobs and assist in the creation of 4 new jobs.		
Consideration of Displacement:	Their business is bespoke and there is no local manufacturing competitor of scale in the market regionally for this type of product.		
Economic justification for project:	The project fits the Local Development Strategy plan for enterprise support		
Average Score for Project:	78/ 100 (2)		
% level of aid & ceiling:	A maximum of €61,250.00 or 50% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.		
E. C. Executive Summary/Rationale for Funding	The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend funding this project for the following reasons:- 1. The project scored 78/100 2. The project fits the Local Development Plan (LDS) for enterprise support. 3. Funding supports the existing 14 jobs and will create four new ones.		

Jobs Created	Jobs Sustained	Match Funding	Previous Grant Aid Received
Sustain 14	4 new jobs	Yes	No

Confirmation on the applicant's position re De-Minus and Double Funding from the relevant agencies.	Date of Confirmation	Signed By
Waterford Local Enterprise Office	24/11/2021	Ms. Brid Kirby

The following were the main points raised in the discussion of the project: -

- Ms Claire Connors advised that this is one of Mr Jimmy Taaffe's projects. The promoters applied for the May call but didn't submit the application in time so re applied under this Call. They had a poor response to e-tender but had also directly invited the responses they received in May to re tender. Currently the promoters outsource the manufacture of internal doors to a company that in turns sources them in China. The purchase of this CNC machine will allow them to manufacture in-house. As they do a lot of specialised off size doors for hospitals, etc this will enable them to provide a faster and more efficient service in Tramore rather than shipping them in from China.
- The promoter has a premises both in Clonmel and Tramore and employees 12 full time employees and 2 part-time.
- The Evaluation Committee discussed deadweight given the amount of funding available to the promoter but agreed to fund at a reduced rate of 50% to support current jobs and help create 4 new jobs.
- The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend funding this project under the European Union Recovery Fund (EURI).

A maximum of €61,250.00 or 50% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.

Amount Recommended: €61,250 or 50% of eligible funding, whichever is the lesser amount	50% of Eligible Project Funding: :€61,250 or 50% of eligible funding, whichever is the lesser amount
---	---

Signed: _____

Signed: _____

Chairperson of Evaluation Committee

Committee Member

Date: _____

Date: _____

Issues / Queries raised by Evaluation Committee	Project Officers Response
None	

Signed: J Taaffe

Dated: 13/12/2021

WLP Project Officer

Evaluation Committee Scoring Record

Date: 8/12/2021

Time: 2:30pm

Project Title: EUEI - Implementation of CNC Machinery at Murphy herkel Timber Products

Project Reference Number: 31202WAT116418

Assessment Criteria	Objective	Issues raised by Evaluation Committee	Weighting	Score
Compatibility with Local Development Strategy	Do the project proposals meet the criteria set out in the LAG business plan for the relevant measure?		Yes / No	
Innovation	Is the product innovative in its nature and does it displace existing enterprises? - Product / Service 9/19 <u>8</u> - Displacement 5/19 <u>5</u> - Job Creation 5/19 <u>5</u>		19	18.
Promoters experience	Does the promoter have the training/skills, track record or experience to deliver? - Standards of Operation 6/25 <u>4</u>. - Track Record 6/25 <u>5</u> - Structure of Business 6/25 <u>5</u> - Necessary skills base 7/25 <u>5</u>		25	19
Financial Viability	Are the project costs justifiable (reasonableness of costs) and / is funding available to co-fund the project? - Overall Costs 7/25 <u>5</u> - Co Funding 6/25 <u>4</u>.		25	19.

	Financial Plan	6/25	5		
	Deadweight	6/25	5		
Sustainability	Is the project viable and will the service continue to be delivered?			13	10
Requirement	Does the proposal target a specific need or address a specific gap in the market?			18	12. 78
Total				100	

N.B. Project must receive a minimum score of 65% prior to being recommended for approval.

- Has the potential level of deadweight been assessed for this project? YES / ~~NO~~
- i.e. would the project proceed without LEADER funding? ~~YES~~ / NO

Recommendations of the Evaluation Committee: Recommend

Signature: 
Signature of Evaluation Committee Chair

Date: 08/12/21

Denise Walsh

From: John Harnedy <johnjharnedy@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday 12 December 2021 17:14
To: Denise Walsh
Subject: Re: WLP Evaluation Minutes 8 12 21

I have reviewed the attached minutes, and I am happy with same.
John

On Sun 12 Dec 2021, 17:10 Denise Walsh, <Denise.Walsh@wlp.ie> wrote:
Hi John,

Attached please find the minutes for your to review.

Thanks & Regards,

Denise Walsh
Administrator / Riarthóir
Waterford Leader Partnership CLG
Lismore Business Park,
Mayfield,
Lismore,
Co. Waterford.

Charities Regulatory Authority No.20070748

F: <https://www.facebook.com/WaterfordLeaderPartnership>
T: <https://twitter.com/wlpleader>
P51 XVP6

Ph: 058-54646 / Mobile: 086 823 6664
Email : denise.walsh@wlp.ie<<mailto:denise.walsh@wlp.ie>>

PLEASE LIKE US ON [cid:image001.gif@01D7EF7A.DDEBDDDB0] <<https://www.facebook.com/#!/pages/Waterford-Leader-Partnership-Ltd/314110866284?fref=ts>>

Unsubscribe - Reply and state Unsubscribe

[cid:image002.jpg@01D7EF7A.DDEBDDDB0][cid:image003.png@01D7EF7A.DDEBDDDB0] [cid:image004.png@01D7EF7A.DDEBDDDB0]
[Description: eu-agricultural] [cid:image006.png@01D7EF7A.DDEBDDDB0]

Tá an ríomhphost seo agus aon iatán a ghabhann leis rúnda agus is d'úsáid an té/na ndaoine a bhfuil sé seolta chuige/chucu, amháin é. D'fhéadfadh an t-ábhar a bheith faoi réir ag pribhléid dhlíthúil agus ghairmiúil. Mura seolaí ainmnithe nó ceaptha an ríomhphost seo tú, níor chóir duit an teachtaireacht seo, nó aon mhír de, a úsáid, a scaoileadh, a chóipeáil, a scaipeadh nó a choimeád. Más amhlaidh go bhfuair tú an ríomhphost seo trí earráid nó trí dhearmad, iarrtar ort sin a chur in iúl don seoltóir láithreach bonn, le do thoil agus aon chóip den ríomhphost seo a scriosadh ó do chóra(i)s ríomhaireachta.

Seiceáladh gach iatán le scanóir aimsithe víreas agus ceaptar iad a bheith saor ó víreas. Iarrtar ort áfach, a dheimhniú go ndéanfar gach teachtaireacht a scanadh ar fhaitíos víris, mar nach féidir aon dliteanas a ghlacadh maidir le haon ionfhabhtú nó damáiste a dhéantar do do chóras ríomhaireachta tríd an ríomhphost seo a fháil.

The information contained in this e-mail and in any attachments is confidential and is designated solely for the

