



Comhpháirtíocht Leader Waterford Leader
Phort Láirge Partnership

Decision of Evaluation Committee

Project ID	31WAT100015
Project Type:	Capital
Project Name:	Knockanore Farmhouse Cheese 2024 Equipment Upgrade
Promoters Name:	Knockanore Farmhouse Cheese Co Ltd
Address:	Ballyneety, Knockanore, Co. Waterford
Description:	The project involves the investment in three key pieces of equipment; a renewable energy HVO boiler to replace an existing boiler that is over 20 years old and at best is 50% efficient. The new boiler will give 80-90% efficiency thus saving energy and reducing emissions due to running on rapeseed oil/spent cooking oil as opposed to the previous boiler running on fossil fuel. The 2nd piece of equipment is an auto cheese packing line which will facilitate less packing and enable the use of recyclable packaging materials as well as providing greater efficiencies. The 3rd piece of equipment is a high tech auto labelling machine which will enable the labelling of larger quantities of product at any one time with more real time information now required by multiple stores.
Theme:	1 Enterprise Development and job creation
Sub-theme:	1a Green Economy
Link to LDS	Supporting enterprises improve efficiencies and reduce carbon footprint

Total Project Costs	€412,390
Eligible Project Costs	€412,390
Funding sought by promoter:	€200,000
State one of the following: - First Review / Previously Deferred or Not Recommend	First Review
Funding recommended by Evaluation Committee:	€143,695
Details of private funding:	€212,390 loan finance
Voluntary Labour: YES / NO (If yes provide detail)	No
Synopsis of project:	Investment in three key pieces of equipment to create greater efficiencies

Detail exactly what WLP will be funding (List items from Project Assessment Report)	Detail	Total Cost (Expenditure)	Grant Aid recommend by the Evaluation Committee @ 50%
	Auto labeller/check weigher	€96,500	€48,250
	Steam boiler	€190,890	€95,445
	Thermoformer	€125,000	€0
	Total Funding	€287,390	€143,695
Was an assessment completed?: Date: 14/06/2024_	Yes		
Are detailed costings provided for the project? Were the costs for the project considered reasonable and how was this measured?	Yes, etendering was used and the most economic advantageous tender process used to select the chosen suppliers		
Where the procurement process resulted in less than 3 quotes, the EC must show the additional steps taken to ensure the reasonableness of costs:	While only one supplier quoted for the steam boiler through etenders, the cost is acceptable given the open tender process undertaken.		
Innovative Element of the project:	All new equipment will reduce the company's carbon emissions and reduce their overall carbon footprint such as less recyclable packaging and the boiler is moving from more recyclable. The equipment is much more efficient, producing higher volumes, quicker and can integrate to existing IT technology.		
Consideration of Deadweight:	The project would only proceed on a reduced basis without grant aid. The promoter would greatly benefit from grant aid to make this significant investment and purchase all elements at once.		
Consideration of Displacement:	The company is quite specialised both making and blending cheese and cutting and packaging for external customers. The nearest cheese companies are; Little Milk Co, Dungarvan, Bo Rua Farm, Ballynoe and Hegarty's Cheese, Cork. The proposed project would not have any negative effect on these businesses by virtue of the difference in business models.		
Economic justification for project:	The creation of 3.2 further jobs whilst sustaining almost 10 jobs in the local area		
Average Score for Project:	85/100 (1)		
% level of aid & ceiling:	A maximum of €143,695.00 or 50% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.		
E. C. Executive Summary/Rationale for Funding	The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend funding this project for the following reasons:- 1. The project aligns with the LCDC Local Development Plan to support projects under Theme 1 Economic Development and Job Creation and the		

	Sub Theme 1a Green Economy. 2. Funding will sustain existing jobs and help create an additional 3 jobs. 3. The project scored 85/100. A maximum of €143,695.00 or 50% of eligible expenditure whichever is the lesser based on the following condition:- 50% funding is to go towards the: - - the HVO Boiler and the Auto Labelling
--	--

Jobs Created	Jobs Sustained	Match Funding	Previous Grant Aid Received
3.2	10	€212,390	€38,000 Bord Bia

Confirmation on the applicant's position re De-Minimis and double from the relevant agencies.	Date of Confirmation	Signed By
Bord Bia	14/05/2024	John Nugent
Local Enterprise Office	20/5/2024	Brid Kirby

The following were the main points raised in the discussion of the project:

- Ms Connors advised that the promoter has been making cheese in Knockanore since 1987 and now employs 13 people.
- They have successfully implemented previous LEADER projects.
- Edward Lonergan, the promoter's son, joined the business in 2022 as financial controller and export manager. The Evaluation Committee noted that this addresses a previous concern raised by the bank regarding succession planning.
- They are branching out into cutting and packaging cheese for other suppliers. The long-term plan is to secure markets abroad, initially in Canada and France.
- For this project, they wish to purchase a renewable energy HVO steam boiler, a high-tech auto labelling machine and a thermoformer.
- Ms Connors advised that on speaking with the promoter and advising him of the limited funds he prioritised the renewable energy HVO steam boiler and the Auto labelling machine.
- The Evaluation Committee noted how the promoter has excellently marketed his products over the years and has won several awards for his artisan products.
- The Evaluation Committee agreed that the HVO Boiler which uses steam rather than fossil fuels and the Auto Labelling machine will fit the Green Economy Theme.
- They noted that the promoter has already received significant assistance and funding from LEADER. They suggested that the remaining elements of the project should be covered

from the business's resources, as the program's funding is limited and should be made available to others who could also benefit from it.

The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend funding this project for the following reasons:-

1. The project aligns with the LCDC Local Development Plan to support projects under Theme 1 Economic Development and Job Creation and the Sub Theme 1a Green Economy.
2. Funding will sustain existing jobs and help create an additional 3 jobs.
3. The project scored 85/100.

A maximum of €143,695.00 or 50% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser based on the following condition:-

50% funding is to go towards the: -

the HVO Boiler and the Auto Labelling Machine

Amount Recommended: €143,695

50 % of Eligible Project Funding: €287,390

Signed: _____

Signed: _____

Chairperson of Evaluation Committee

Committee Member

Date: _____

Date: _____

Issues / Queries raised by Evaluation Committee	Project Officers Response

Signed: _____

Clair Lewis

Dated: __4th of July '24__

WLP Project Officer



Overall Evaluation Committee Scoring Record

Project Title: Knoxhane Embankment Cheek 2024 Equipment Upgrade	Project Reference no: 15-WA-1000-15	Date: 1/7/2024	Time: 11am
--	---	--------------------------	----------------------

Q	Assessment Criteria	Objective	Evaluation Committee comments	Weighting	Score	
1	Has project development officer report indicated that any documentation / information requested has not been provided by the project promoter(s)	Ensure that the project promoter has provided all the required information / documentation requested by project development officer to progress this project.		N/A	Pass	Fail
2	Displacement	Does the project comply with displacement requirements?		N/A	Pass	Fail
3	Compatibility with Local Development Strategy (LDS)	Do the project proposals meet the criteria set out in the LAG's LDS for the relevant measure?			14	
4	Innovation	Is the project innovative in its nature?			14	
5	Project Promoter experience	Does the promoter have the training/skills, track record or experience to deliver?			14	
6	Financial Viability	Do the proposed actions and associated costs appear reasonable and represent value for money, and is adequate funding available to co-fund the project?			14	
7	Sustainability	Is the project viable and will the service continue to be delivered?			15	
8	Requirement	Does the proposal target a specific need or address a specific gap in the market?			14	
9	Deadweight	Would the project proceed without LEADER funding?	YES	N/A	N/A	
N.B. Prior to being recommended for approval, projects must: - pass question 1 and 2 - answer no to question 9 - receive a minimum score of 65%.				Total:	85	

Recommendation of the Evaluation Committee:

Recommended for approval.

Signature of Committee Chair: John Woburney Date: 1/7/2024

Denise Walsh

From: john moloney <moloney.john5@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday 5 July 2024 13:01
To: Denise Walsh
Subject: Re: Evaluation Meeting 1 July 2024 - draft evaluation minutes

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Due By: Monday 8 July 2024 09:30
Flag Status: Flagged

Hi Denise

I have reviewed the minutes and I am satisfied that they are a true record of the discussion and recommendations of the meeting of the WLP Evaluation Committee on July 1st 2024.

Thank you
Regards
John Moloney

On Fri, 5 Jul 2024 at 10:08, Denise Walsh <Denise.Walsh@wlp.ie> wrote:

Good Morning John,

Attached please find the draft evaluation minutes for you to review.

Kind Regards,

Denise Walsh

Riarthóir / Administrator

Comhpháirtíocht Leader Phort Láirge / Waterford Leader Partnership CLG

Páirc Ghnó an Leasa Mhóir, Lios Mór, Co. Phort Láirge P51XVP6 / Lismore Business Park, Lismore, Co. Waterford P51 XVP6

Fón 058-54646 /086 823 6664

Ríomhphost /Email : denise.walsh@wlp.ie

Láithreán Gréasáin / Website www.wlp.ie