



Comhpháirtíocht Leader Waterford Leader  
Phort Láirge Partnership

### Decision of Evaluation Committee

|                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Project ID</b>      | IE31WAT100022                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| <b>Project Type:</b>   | Capital                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| <b>Project Name:</b>   | Vinilo Bakery Machinery                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| <b>Promoters Name:</b> | Vinilo represented by Lucy O'Hanrahan                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| <b>Address:</b>        | 8 Main Street, Lismore, Co. Waterford                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| <b>Description:</b>    | To expand and make bakery production more efficient by installing new machinery. The machinery required includes a 4-deck stone-based bread oven with an integrated steam system and setter and a bakery proofer/retarder. This machinery will greatly improve product quality and be much more energy efficient.                                                        |
| <b>Theme:</b>          | Theme 1: Economic Development & Job Creation                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <b>Sub-theme:</b>      | Sub-theme 1a: The Green Economy                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| <b>Link to LDS</b>     | Local objective 1: Investment in indigenous rural enterprises to maximise efficiencies and competitiveness, increase the offering for visitors whilst supporting a greener sustainable environment.<br><br>Strategic Action 1.1 1a: Green Economy: Capital investment in existing and start up technology that embraces greater efficiency and supports the environment. |

|                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Total Project Costs</b>                                                                       | €42,975.86                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| <b>Eligible Project Costs</b>                                                                    | €42,975.86                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| <b>Funding sought by promoter:</b>                                                               | €32,231.89                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| <b>State one of the following: -<br/>First Review / Previously Deferred or<br/>Not Recommend</b> | First Review – Not recommended                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| <b>Funding recommended by Evaluation<br/>Committee:</b>                                          | The Evaluation Committee did not recommend this project due to the possibility of displacement and the retail aspect of the business which makes it ineligible for LEADER funding.                                                                                                                                                            |
| <b>Details of private funding:</b>                                                               | Bank accounts                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| <b>Voluntary Labour: YES / NO (If yes<br/>provide detail)</b>                                    | No                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| <b>Synopsis of project:</b>                                                                      | The current project is to expand and make bakery production more efficient by installing new machinery. Machinery required includes a 4-deck stone-based bread oven with an integrated steam system and setter and a bakery proofer/retarder. This machinery will also greatly improve our product quality and be much more energy efficient. |

| Detail exactly what WLP will be funding (List items from Project Assessment Report)                                                                     | Detail                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Total Cost (Expenditure) | Grant Aid recommend by the Evaluation Committee @ 0% |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------|
|                                                                                                                                                         | Salva modular deck oven with steam injection                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | 24, 870.78               | Nil                                                  |
|                                                                                                                                                         | Setter/loader for deck oven                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | 9,445.08                 | Nil                                                  |
|                                                                                                                                                         | Salva iverpan proofer/retarder                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 8,660.00                 | Nil                                                  |
|                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                          |                                                      |
| <b>Total Funding</b>                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | <b>€42,975.86</b>        | <b>Nil</b>                                           |
| <b>Was an assessment completed?: Date:</b>                                                                                                              | 01.07.2024                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                          |                                                      |
| <b>Are detailed costings provided for the project? Were the costs for the project considered reasonable and how was this measured?</b>                  | Yes, direct tendering was used and the MEAT process to score tenders.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                          |                                                      |
| <b>Where the procurement process resulted in less than 3 quotes, the EC must show the additional steps taken to ensure the reasonableness of costs:</b> | Not applicable                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                          |                                                      |
| <b>Innovative Element of the project:</b>                                                                                                               | Bakery machinery that will improve efficiency and effectiveness while lowering energy consumption and cost.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                          |                                                      |
| <b>Added Value – How will the added value of LEADER funding be demonstrated in the delivery of this project?</b>                                        | The LEADER funding will contribute to improved production and quality. This will ensure the sustainability of the business creating more employment opportunities. It also brings both locals and visitors to Lismore adding to the vibrancy to the main street while also benefiting other nearby businesses with the increased footfall.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                          |                                                      |
| <b>Consideration of Deadweight:</b>                                                                                                                     | <p>Promoter's Response: Financially we would not be able to proceed with the full project without support. We would instead proceed only with part of the project - purchasing just the proofer/retarder and would not be able to purchase the oven. We would have to leave this part of the project to the future and hope it would be more attainable then. It would be unfortunate to not complete the full project as it is now that the demand for our products is growing. We do not want to miss the opportunity to scale up, skill up and meet this demand.</p> <p>PO Response: Without financial support the promoter will only be able to proceed with purchasing the proofer/retarder and not the oven. This will not provide the wrap-around solution the various elements of this project offer and will impact on the outcomes of the project.</p> |                          |                                                      |
| <b>Consideration of Displacement:</b>                                                                                                                   | Consideration was given to displacement. Vinilo is a going concern and has not proven to be in competition with other businesses in its current location. However, as it had plans to expand to a 2 <sup>nd</sup> and 3 <sup>rd</sup> premises in other commercial towns, the risk of displacement increased significantly and was flagged as a concern by the Evaluation Committee.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                          |                                                      |
| <b>Economic justification for project:</b>                                                                                                              | This project will increase quality, production and energy efficiency enabling the bakery to expand the business.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                          |                                                      |
| <b>Average Score for Project:</b>                                                                                                                       | Not scored as question 2 on the scorecard response was 'Fail', as the project did not comply with displacement requirements.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                          |                                                      |
| <b>% level of aid &amp; ceiling:</b>                                                                                                                    | 0%. The Evaluation Committee did not recommend this project.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                          |                                                      |

|                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
|------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>E. C. Executive Summary/Rationale for Funding</b> | <p>The Evaluation Committee agreed not to recommend funding this project for the following reasons:-</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1.The project's envisaged expansion to a 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> retail unit poses a risk of displacements in other towns.</li> <li>2.The project is borderline retail and cannot be funded by LEADER.</li> </ol> |
|------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

| Jobs Created | Jobs Sustained | Match Funding  | Previous Grant Aid Received |
|--------------|----------------|----------------|-----------------------------|
|              | 4.6            | Not applicable | LEADER = €18,800 (2022)     |
|              |                |                |                             |
|              |                |                |                             |

| Confirmation on the applicant's position re De-Minimis and double from the relevant agencies. | Date of Confirmation | Signed By  |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------|------------|
| Confirmation was received from LEO.                                                           | 22 May 2024          | Brid Kirby |
|                                                                                               |                      |            |
|                                                                                               |                      |            |

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>The following were the main points raised in the discussion of the project: -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms Rossi advised that the promoters were supported in 2022 for the manufacture of bakery products at their premises in Lismore. Now there is a question that their business maybe considered more conventional retail as the café element has grown. The rules state that conventional retail operations are ineligible excluding community based shops and farm shops, outlets selling locally produced produce.</li> <li>- After raising the issue with the Department, they advised that they don't want to be too prescriptive in the operating guidelines, and want the Evaluation Committee to review and the LAG to decide.</li> <li>- Ms Rossi outlined the proposed project advising that the promoters wish to increase production by purchasing a four-deck oven. The new oven has temperature control and steam injection which is a vital part of the sourdough process.The current oven has three decks. With this increased production the promoter intends to expand into other commercial towns to sell their products.</li> <li>- The promoters confirmed that 68% of their profits come from the sale of their baked goods. They will supply Farm Gate in Lismore and have sold to Strandcally Castle and the Blackwater Valley Opera Festival for events. They view themselves as a manufacturing bakery rather than a café.</li> <li>- The Evaluation Committee discussed if the promoters are eligible as an outlet selling locally produced produce and agreed that they are for Lismore but queried if this would apply for the proposed expansion, where they would be considered purely retail.</li> <li>- The Evaluation Committee discussed the proposed expansion and if the promoters intended to sell to other outlets or open a shop or a café themselves. Selling to other outlets would not displace existing retail or coffee shops but to open premises selling their products would cause displacement.</li> <li>- It was noted that it was very beneficial to Lismore to have the business operating there, and that they are selling locally produced product. A discussion ensued on how they have succeeded in Lismore where many businesses have failed. It was noted that it is a big advantage that the premises is family-owned.</li> <li>- Ms Rossi confirmed that the new equipment will be more efficient.</li> </ul> |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

- Upon confirming that the promoters planned to open the premises in both Fermoy and Youghal to sell their products, the Evaluation Committee concluded that displacement would be an issue.
- The Evaluation Committee stated that the promoters have a fantastic product but agreed that funding them would give them an unfair competitive advantage and cause displacement.

The Evaluation Committee agreed to recommend not funding this project for the following reasons:-

- 1) The project and the proposed expansion would be considered retail and therefore will cause displacement.

A maximum of €0 or 0% of eligible expenditure, whichever is the lesser.

**Amount Recommended: €0**

**0 % of Eligible Project Funding: €0**

**Signed:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Signed:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Chairperson of Evaluation Committee**

**Committee Member**

**Date:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Date:** \_\_\_\_\_

| Issues / Queries raised by Evaluation Committee | Project Officers Response |
|-------------------------------------------------|---------------------------|
| Not applicable                                  | Not applicable            |

**Signed:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Dated:** \_\_\_\_\_

**WLP Project Officer**

**Please insert photos below of reference purposes:**





|                        |                       |            |       |
|------------------------|-----------------------|------------|-------|
| Project Title:         | Project Reference no: | Date:      | Time: |
| Visit Bakery Machinery | IE31WAT100022         | 17/12/2024 | 11am  |

Signature of Committee Chair: Tim Volney

## Denise Walsh

---

**From:** john moloney <moloney.john5@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Friday 5 July 2024 13:01  
**To:** Denise Walsh  
**Subject:** Re: Evaluation Meeting 1 July 2024 - draft evaluation minutes

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Due By:** Monday 8 July 2024 09:30  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

Hi Denise

I have reviewed the minutes and I am satisfied that they are a true record of the discussion and recommendations of the meeting of the WLP Evaluation Committee on July 1st 2024.

Thank you  
Regards  
John Moloney

On Fri, 5 Jul 2024 at 10:08, Denise Walsh <[Denise.Walsh@wlp.ie](mailto:Denise.Walsh@wlp.ie)> wrote:

Good Morning John,

Attached please find the draft evaluation minutes for you to review.

Kind Regards,

Denise Walsh

Riarthóir / Administrator

Comhpháirtíocht Leader Phort Láirge / Waterford Leader Partnership CLG

Páirc Ghnó an Leasa Mhóir, Lios Mór, Co. Phort Láirge P51XVP6 / Lismore Business Park, Lismore, Co. Waterford  
P51 XVP6

Fón 058-54646 /086 823 6664

Ríomhphost /Email : [denise.walsh@wlp.ie](mailto:denise.walsh@wlp.ie)

Láithreán Gréasáin / Website [www.wlp.ie](http://www.wlp.ie)